IDENTIFYING, RECRUITING AND DEPLOYING EFFECTIVE TEACHERS IN KANO AND KADUNA STATES
Acknowledgements

This study was led by the authors with support from Professor Oladele Akogun and Victor Steenbergen.

The fieldwork conducted in Kaduna State was carried out by Hafsat Lawal Kontagora (National Teachers’ Institute), Abigail Adze (State Ministry of Education), Emmanuel Gyong (Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria), Umma K. Ahmed (SUBEB), Jummai Garba (National Teachers’ Institute), Lawal Momoh Hussaini (Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria), Amos Jacob Aboy (SUBEB) and Aminu Mohammed (State Ministry of Education).

The fieldwork conducted in Kano State was carried out by Bala Zakari (Bayero University), Basheer Sani Muhammad (SUBEB), Ahmed Kwaru Mohammed (Bayero State University), Sa’id Suwaiba Ahmed (Bayero State University), Ashiru Sharada Muhammad (Bayero State University), Suwaiba Abdulmumini (SUBEB) and Hadiza Usman (SUBEB).

Nandi Chetden, Esohe Evbuomwan and Ijeoma Iroaganachi from EDOREN provided invaluable support.

We are grateful to the teachers, head teachers and state officials and others who took part in this research. This study would not have been possible without them. In keeping with the traditions of qualitative research, they were promised anonymity and so they cannot be individually named. However, we would like to thank them for giving up their time and for sharing their experiences and insights in a frank and forthright manner.

We are also grateful to DFID for funding this study and to OPML for supporting it.

The study was conducted by Education Data, Research, and Evaluation in Nigeria (EDOREN) under our workstream on Thematic Research. This workstream is led by Ian MacAuslan (ian.macauslan@edoren.org). The EDOREN Country Director is Professor Oladele Akogun (oladele.akogun@edoren.org). Please contact either for further information.

*Photo Credit: Britain Nigeria Education Trust
Executive Summary

EDOREN was encouraged by DFID to explore in-depth issues relating to the recruitment and deployment of teachers in public primary schools in Northern Nigeria with the long-term expectation of establishing a robust cadre of effective primary teachers through appropriate evidence-based policy change.

The main intentions of the study were to: investigate and document research evidence; support the government to improve teacher effectiveness; help support research capacity; and build sustainable partnerships.

Kaduna and Kano States were identified as collaborating partners as both had existing strong relationships with DFID-funded education initiatives and wider DFID engagement in state-level programmes. At a launch event held in Kaduna, the two States were invited to create research teams to bid for funded engagement in this work. The conditions pertaining were to be:

- The focus of the research in the two States was to relate to the identification, recruitment and deployment of primary teachers.
- The research teams from each State should comprise eight individuals, evenly divided by gender and by location in government/academic environments.
- Formal ‘letters of interest’ should be submitted in a competitive process assessed by external scrutineers.
- All expenses of the research would be met but there would be no consultancy fees, as all involved would be working on the research in normal work time.

Following the selection of two teams, they were prepared for the task through research planning meetings. The research was conceptualised in two phases:

Phase 1 – Identification of effective primary teachers

Methodology: Finding a sample population for study; semi-structured interviews with nominated teachers and their headteachers; classroom observation.

Phase 2 – Recruitment and deployment of effective teachers

Methodology: This needed a two-stage process, the first being the drafting of protocols covering all aspects of identifying, recruiting and employing the teachers. The challenging part of the work was taking these drafts for validation processes by a range of stakeholders, chiefly managers at various levels of the system.

Throughout the programme, a series of planning meetings were held and managed by EDOREN and involving all the researchers. These five-day meetings were held as follows:

- 6-10 June 2016: Phase 1 planning and budgeting
- 3 – 7 October 2016: Phase 2 planning
- 23 – 27 January 2017: Development of State Reports/validation with LGEA ESs

The revised protocols were then exposed to further scrutiny in two research meetings – one in each State – to which all LGEA Education Secretaries were invited:

- 27 January 2017: Kaduna State
• 30 January 2017: Kano State

The findings of the two phases of the research are reported in sections 3 (Phase 1) and 4 (Phase 2) of this report. The concise conclusions of the research are presented in section 6 but are reproduced here to complete the Executive Summary:

• Working in two States of Northern Nigeria, it has proved possible and constructive to create research teams which unusually brought together those who are charged with carrying out research (four academics) and those who are charged with managing a primary education system (four MoE and/or SUBEB staff). Each team had a balance of genders. Careful preparation of the teams gave them confidence to carry out fieldwork at a variety of levels – school, LGEA, SUBEB and MoE.

• Phase One of the research allowed the identification in each State of a group of 40 effective primary teachers through a process of nomination (to identify a population for study) whose practices were documented through interviews and classroom observations. The data generated was used to develop: (i) a series of case studies; and (ii) clearly defined job descriptions for both P1-P3 and P4-P6 teachers. Additionally, there was important learning about how these teachers operated successfully in frequently less than conducive working environments.

• Phase Two of the research depended on the development of strong draft protocols for each part of the recruitment and deployment processes for primary teachers. So that for recruitment, descriptions were generated covering the following areas: needs analysis; advertising and applying; testing and interviewing; appointing. At least in part as a result of the team composition, it proved possible to undertake a validation process with the drafts through interactions with different groups of stakeholders, chiefly those with direct responsibility for teacher recruitment, thus: MoE and SUBEB Directors; LGEA Education Secretaries; Head teachers. We conclude that, for each State, a robust set of protocols is now ready for wider field testing in pilot/trial settings.

• We note and acknowledge the continuing undercurrent of scepticism regarding the ways in which these instruments may be undermined by political decisions (often legitimate) and patronage (never legitimate). Our response is simply that policy-related research of this kind can only provide the tools by which transparent processes can occur if there is a supportive political will. We have to presume that the development of quality primary schooling for all children is a high order political priority in both States.

• We take this opportunity to report early successes relating to the use of the findings of this research in Kaduna State. It is not an accident that a member of the Kaduna research team is the Director of Recruitment. For the next recruitment cycle, commencing in May 2017, she has already been able to put in place new approaches to: school staffing needs analysis; on-line job advertising; use of job descriptions in the recruitment process; and, overhaul of interview procedures. Work in progress is consideration of significant allowances for rural postings.

• Over the next one year, there are two priorities:
  - In Kaduna and Kano States, initiating well-structured pilots/trials of the various approaches in carefully managed and observed settings. This will strengthen the relationships between the research teams and the management cadre.
  - Taking the approach to other States, with different levels of EDOREN-related inputs.
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................. 1

Executive Summary .................................................................................................................. 2

- Phase 1 – Identification of effective primary teachers ......................................................... 2
- Phase 2 – Recruitment and deployment of effective teachers .............................................. 2

List of Abbreviations ................................................................................................................. 6

1 Background .............................................................................................................................. 7

- 1.1 Scope of the study ............................................................................................................. 7
- 1.2 Methodology ................................................................................................................... 7
  - Phase 1: Identification of effective teachers .......................................................................... 8
  - Phase 2: Recruitment and deployment of effective teachers ............................................... 8

2 Literature Review ..................................................................................................................... 10

3 Phase One in Two States ......................................................................................................... 13

- 3.1 Methodology .................................................................................................................. 13
- 3.2 Participating teachers ...................................................................................................... 14
- 3.3 The characteristics of effective teachers ......................................................................... 15
- 3.4 Comparisons with other teachers .................................................................................. 17
- 3.5 Advice for other teachers ............................................................................................... 17

4 Phase Two in Two States ......................................................................................................... 18

- 4.1 Case studies .................................................................................................................... 18
  - 4.1.1 Task list: case studies ............................................................................................... 18
  - 4.1.2 Kaduna case studies ................................................................................................. 19
  - 4.1.3 Kano case studies .................................................................................................... 20
  - 4.1.4 Case descriptions: summary ................................................................................... 20
- 4.2 Job descriptions ................................................................................................................ 21
  - 4.2.1 Task list: job descriptions ......................................................................................... 21
  - 4.2.2 Kaduna job descriptions .......................................................................................... 21
  - 4.2.3 Kano job descriptions ............................................................................................ 22
- 4.3 Recruitment policy: needs assessment, advertising and recruitment ............................ 23
  - 4.3.1 Task list: recruitment policy ..................................................................................... 24
  - 4.3.2 Needs assessment ..................................................................................................... 24
  - Kaduna needs assessment ................................................................................................. 24
  - Kano needs assessment .................................................................................................... 25
  - 4.3.3 Advertising and application processes ...................................................................... 25
  - Kaduna advertising and application processes .................................................................. 25
  - Kano advertising and application processes .................................................................... 26
  - 4.3.4 Selection and interview processes .......................................................................... 26
  - Kaduna selection and interview processes ........................................................................ 26
  - Kano selection and interview processes .......................................................................... 27
- 4.4 Deployment policy ........................................................................................................... 28
  - 4.4.1 Task list: deployment policy ..................................................................................... 28
  - 4.4.2 Kaduna deployment policy ....................................................................................... 28
  - 4.4.3 Kano deployment policy .......................................................................................... 29

5 Stakeholder Dialogues: LGEA Education Secretaries .............................................................. 30

- 5.1 Validation processes ....................................................................................................... 30
Identifying, Recruiting and Deploying Effective Teachers in Kano and Kaduna States

5.2 Job descriptions 30
5.3 Needs analysis 30
5.4 Advertising of posts 30
5.5 Interview process 31
5.6 Deployment 31
5.7 Final validation meeting 31

6 Conclusions 32

References 33

Annex A Case Studies of Effective Teachers in Kaduna State 35
A.1 Case study one 35
A.2 Case study two 35

Annex B Case Studies of Effective Teachers in Kano State 37
B.1 Case study one 37
B.2 Case study two 37

Annex C Proposed Job Description for Kaduna State 39
Annex D Proposed Job Description for Kano State 40
List of Abbreviations

CoE       College of Education
DAS       Director of Administration and Supplies
DFID      Department for International Development (UK)
EDOREN    Education, Data, Research and Evaluation in Nigeria
ES        Education Secretary
ESSPIN    Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria
ET        Effective Teacher
FGD       Focus Group Discussion
G&C       Guidance and Counselling
HT        Head Teacher
LGA       Local Government Authority
LGEA      Local Government Education Authority
MoE       Ministry of Education
NCE       Nigerian Certificate of Education
NTI       National Teachers’ Institute
NUT       National Union of Teachers
OPML      Oxford Policy Management Ltd
PES       Primary Education Studies
PTA       Parent Teacher Association
SBMC      School Based Management Committee
SLP       State Level Partnership
SSO       School Support Officer
SUBEB     State Universal Basic Education Board
QA(O)      Quality Assurance Officer
TMIS      Teacher Management Information System
TRCN      Teachers Registration Council of Nigeria
1 Background

1.1 Scope of the study

An earlier EDOREN study of primary teachers in Kaduna and Katsina States (Watts & Allsop, 2014) – their conditions of work, working environment, management and professional development – pointed to important unresolved issues relating to the identification, recruitment and deployment of primary teachers in these States. There was reason to believe that many of the issues thrown up were not restricted in their applicability to other states.

EDOREN received encouragement from DFID to push this initial study further so as to systematically explore issues which go to the heart of establishing a robust cadre of effective primary teachers and primary schools.

Throughout the study, the researchers were reminded of the main intentions of the research, i.e. to:

- help support research capacity;
- build sustainable partnerships;
- investigate and document research evidence; and
- support the government to improve teacher effectiveness through the development of evidence-based policy recommendations.

Studies from Kaduna and Katsina States suggest recruitment is officially structured around formal mechanisms but practically based on pressures from elites, traditional rulers and politicians. Unqualified teachers are employed based on their patronage or by passing off fake certificates or impersonating other teachers. There is mention of political appointees who “won’t come to school”, while “those that want to do the job and have the qualification are not employed” (Watts & Allsop, 2014). Accounts also highlight LGA Chairmen “handing out teaching jobs to their friends” or LGA officers being threatened with removal from office if they do not comply with certain posting requests (Bennell et al., 2015).

Against this background, significant changes have recently taken place in Kaduna and Kano States. In Kaduna, the election of a new government has seen the appointment of a new Commissioner of Education who is already overseeing changes of the sort advocated in this study. In Kano, however, recent legislation has seen responsibility for the recruitment and deployment of primary school teachers devolved from SUBEB to the LGEAs. At the time of reporting, the consequences of this for transparent processes remain to be seen.

1.2 Methodology

Two States were identified, both members at that time of DFID’s suite of State Level Partnerships (SLPs). Kaduna and Kano also have well-recognised challenges relating to the issues of interest to the study.

In April 2016, a Research Launch Event was held in Kaduna, to which a wide range of potentially interested parties were invited, from both government and academic backgrounds. They were told that:

- The focus of the research in the two States was to relate to the identification, recruitment and deployment of primary teachers.
- The research teams from each state should comprise eight individuals, evenly divided by gender and location in government/academic environments.
- Formal ‘letters of interest’ should be submitted in a competitive process assessed by external scrutineers.

- All expenses of the research would be met but there would be no consultancy fees, as all involved would be working on the research in normal work time.

Bids were received, assessed and scored according to criteria which had been available to the proposers. Two teams, one from each State, stood out in relation to both their understanding of the task and the appropriateness of the proposed team members. There was only one drop-out from the original teams, caused by the promotion of one member of the Kano team to be Permanent Secretary in the State MoE, who reasonably concluded he could not allot sufficient time to the research (but remained engaged with its progress).

EDOREN’s Research Capacity Strengthening Strategy (Watts & Akogun, 2017) was embedded in this study. The strategy’s aim is to encourage the development and implementation of evidence-based education policy through greater collaboration between policymakers/practitioners and academics. It involves researchers from the two sectors sharing skills and knowledge. The planning sessions were therefore led by the EDOREN facilitators and provided methodological guidance but the teams were encouraged, under appropriate supervision and with appropriate scrutiny, to develop their own specific methodologies.

The research was constructed in two phases, accounts of the findings of which provide the major part of the research.

**Phase 1: Identification of effective teachers**

It seemed important to achieve clarity regarding the characteristics of effective teachers in public primary schools in the two States. In a simple design, each research team interviewed head teachers, School Support Officers (SSOs) and other officials in several LGEAs. Some were one-to-one interviews, others were focus groups. The purpose was to identify a group of up to fifty likely effective teachers in each state, who could then be pursued through interview and observation.

The qualitative analysis of this interview data, carried out by each research team, generated the results described in section 3 below. The results were validated in discussions with senior stakeholders in the two States. They were also used to generate a small number of case studies of effective teachers to be used in Phase 2 (see Annexes A and B).

**Phase 2: Recruitment and deployment of effective teachers**

If Phase 1 was straightforward both in theory and practice, Phase 2 presented several challenges. The essence of Phase 2 was to generate a series of protocols covering four linked areas:

- Case studies of effective teachers
- Job descriptions for primary teachers
- Advertising and recruitment processes
- Deployment processes
These were created in planning sessions with the research teams, led by Terry Allsop, Victor Steenbergen and Michael Watts. The four sets of documents were scrutinised by the research teams and prepared for exposure to relevant stakeholders. For example, the case studies of effective teachers were discussed with students and tutors in Colleges of Education. The participants in this phase of the study are noted in section 4 below. The recruitment protocols were exposed to critical scrutiny/validation by a series of relevant stakeholders up to senior managers in SUBEB/MoE.

Throughout the programme, a series of planning meetings were held, managed by EDOREN and involving the two teams of researchers. These five-day meetings were held as follows:

- 6-10 June 2016: Phase 1 planning and budgeting
- 3 – 7 October 2016: Phase 2 planning
- 23 – 27 January 2017: Development of State Reports/validation with LGEA ESs

The revised protocols were then exposed to further scrutiny in two research meetings – one in each State – to which all LGEA Education Secretaries were invited:

- 27 January 2017: Kaduna State
- 30 January 2017: Kano State

These meetings led to a further modification/adjustment of the protocols. However, it should be noted that the earlier scrutiny/validation processes meant that the protocols were broadly accepted by the LGEA ESs in both States.

Finally, there was a final round of exposure of the findings to a meeting of senior officials with the research teams, on 5 April 2017. It is noteworthy that this meeting incorporated observers from Jigawa, Yobe and Zamfara States. This indicates the appetite for evidence-based policy change in Northern Nigeria.

During the final research meeting, research reports were drafted for each State. These are synthesised in sections 3 and 4.
2 Literature Review

Teacher effectiveness is often implicitly defined as the extent to which a teacher contributes to improvements in her or his students’ learning outcomes (Hanushek & Rivkin, 2010; Bruns & Luque, 2013). These outcomes are typically measured by test scores, particularly literacy and numeracy tests. However, Ko and Sammons (2013) argue that teacher effectiveness is a multi-dimensional concept and that there is little agreement on how it should be interpreted. They add that the goals of education systems often go beyond the delivery of academic curricula to include the development of non-cognitive skills such as resilience and adaptability, the promotion of students’ emotional well-being and the development of their social skills.

The international evidence suggests that teacher effectiveness is weakly correlated with observable traits like age, seniority, formal qualifications and level of education (Bruns & Luque, 2014) but it is recognised that it can change in response to other factors. For example, the longitudinal study of teachers in England by Day et al. (2006) found that teachers’ commitment and resilience had a crucial impact on their effectiveness and were influenced by a range of factors including their relationships with school leaders and their colleagues, the quality of leadership at the school level and in government and pupils’ academic progress. What is often described as teachers’ ‘identity’ has also been found to influence their effectiveness and this, too, is shaped by a range of factors.

Various types of information have been used to assess teacher effectiveness. These include analysis of data on pupils’ educational outcomes, observations of teachers’ classroom practices, assessments by school supervisors, the judgements of school head teachers, and students’ perceptions. However, recognition of the multidimensional nature of teacher effectiveness and awareness of measurement errors have led to calls for assessment using combinations of different data sources (Kain & Staiger, 2010; Steele et al., 2010; Ko & Sammons, 2013). The literature also highlights the need to take account of how measures of teacher effectiveness are to be used (e.g. providing feedback to those teachers, determining pay and promotion, identifying effective practices).

In Nigeria, the ESSPIN Composite Surveys have used a lesson observation tool to assess certain aspects of teacher practice that ESSPIN is seeking to improve. The tool generates information on:

- classroom organisation (the share of time spent on whole class teaching, group tasks, individual tasks and no pupil activity);
- the extent to which the teacher makes effective use of teaching aids;
- the extent to which the teacher uses praise instead of reprimand;
- the share of time spent on different types of instruction (e.g. explaining, dictating, whole class chants, open questions/responses); and
- the extent to which the teacher is spatially inclusive (involving children seated in different parts of the class) and gender inclusive.

This tool is not intended to provide a comprehensive measure of teacher effectiveness and, in line with this, has not been validated using student assessment data. However, it does assess some important components of teachers’ practice and addresses some of the weaknesses identified in the literature on teacher effectiveness in Nigeria (e.g. Abd-Kadir & Hardman, 2008; Hardman et al., 2008).

That literature highlights the longstanding concerns about student performance in Nigeria’s schools that has led to a focus on teacher effectiveness (Akiri, 2013; Ewetan & Ewetan, 2015). In his assessment of the effectiveness of teachers of prevocational subjects in Ogun State’s secondary schools, Kiadese summarises interpretations of effective teaching found in the Nigerian literature (2011) which include: the imparting of knowledge, skills and
attitude to bring about desirable changes in learners; ensuring that meaningful learning occurs; the extent to which student performance improves over a period of instruction; activities that generate the most productive and beneficial student learning experiences and that promote their development as learners; and purposeful activity that enables knowledge transfer.

However, the sustained focus on student performance has generated a dominant narrative which typically equates teacher effectiveness with – and reduces it to – learning outcomes measured by examination results (Ogunsaju, 2004; Adediwura & Tayo, 2007; Adu & Olatunde, 2007; Adeyemi, 2008). As Akiri suggests in his study of effective teachers in Delta State’s secondary schools, it is easy to how ‘effective teachers should produce students of higher academic performance’ (2013, p. 106). Yet he goes on to argue that there is no significant relationship between their effectiveness and their students’ academic performance (see also Akiri & Ugborugbo, 2009). Other factors can have significant impacts on student performance but the correlation with student performance persists and frames numerous studies examining the influence of teaching qualifications, length of service and gender – the main variables addressed in the Nigerian literature – on the effectiveness of teachers.

Most studies addressing the significance of teaching qualifications focus on secondary school teachers. Simbo (2003), Adu and Olatundun (2007) and Kiadese (2011) all argue that the qualification of teachers has no significant impact on their students’ performance. However, Akiri (2013) found very significant differences in the academic performance of students taught by highly qualified (MEd), moderately qualified (BEd) and less qualified (NCE) teachers in Delta State. Those students mostly taught by more highly qualified teachers tended to secure better results (see also Adekola, 2006; Akiri & Ugborugbo, 2009; Akinsolu, 2010). It is worth noting, though, that Akiri also found that the higher the teachers’ qualifications, the lower their career satisfaction (2014). This articulates with Adetayo’s study of NTI NCE students who were found to be more significantly committed to teaching than full time students (2016).

Adetayo suggests that the NTI NCE students, as practising teachers, were more committed than full time students who had less investment in teaching and may therefore be more ready to leave if better opportunities arose (2016). Ifamuyiwa (2008) makes a similar argument. The Head Teachers and Education Officers taking part in Adeyemi’s study of secondary schools in Ondo State (2008) were unanimous in believing that more experienced teachers (those with twelve and more years of service) were able to secure better student results. Their belief has been backed up by several studies examining the correlations between length of service and secondary school examination results (Adeyemi, 2008; Akiri & Ugborugbo, 2009; Akinsolu, 2010; Akiri, 2013; Ewetan & Ewetan, 2015) all of which concluded that teachers’ experience has a considerable influence on their students’ academic performance. However, Adegbile and Adeyemi (2008) took a different approach to their study of teacher effectiveness in Osun State’s primary schools. Instead of relying on examination results, they conducted detailed classroom observations and, based on this different metric, concluded that there was no significant difference between more and less experienced teachers.

Several studies examining gender in both primary and secondary schools found that there was no significant difference between female and male teachers when assessing their effectiveness (Olatoye, 2006; Adegbile & Adeyemi, 2008; Kiadese, 2011). Adegbile and Adeyemi (2008) seemed surprised by this. The basis for that surprise is not explained but the tenor of their report suggests they may have been expecting greater effectiveness from the male teachers. However, Adetayo (2008) argued that male teachers are more likely to consider teaching below them and so, presumably, are less likely to be effective.

Joshua and Kritsonis (2006) make clear that Nigerian teachers are typically unhappy with the use of student results as a metric for their competence and effectiveness. This is hardly surprising given the many factors that can influence both. These include student-teacher ratios (Akinsolu, 2010) and infrastructure and resourcing (Akiri & Ugborugbo, 2009; Akiri, 2013) as well as appropriate pedagogic training (Ayeni, 2005; Kanu & Ukpabi, 2007; Kiadese, 2011; Daso, 2013) and training in the use of assessment and evaluation (Ololube, 2008). Attitude, morale and teacher-student relationships have also been identified as factors potentially influencing
effectiveness (Akiri & Ugborugbo, 2009; Akiri, 2013; Daso, 2013; Adetayo, 2016). Noting the significance of these other factors, Akiri explains that:

The reported level of students’ performance may not be a good reflection of the quality of the schools. It may be more of the function of the quality of students and the environment of learning in public secondary schools. The students come into the school with low intellectual ability and poor attitude to academic work. Therefore, the student’s factors may be more responsible for the reported level of student’s performance in these schools than teachers’ effectiveness. A possible consequence of this is that students’ and school environment factors may have marked the actual influence of teachers’ effectiveness (Akiri, 2013, p. 110).

Kiadese (2011) proposes the following characteristics of an effective (junior secondary school) teacher: the importance of a broad-based knowledge of the subject matter, effective use of the chalkboard, good language and communication skills, a well-organised learning environment and the identification of clear objectives. They are less easy to evaluate than examination results but, as Adegbile and Adeyemi (2008) argue, it is important to understand how effective teachers actually teach.

It is against this wider background of primary teaching in Nigeria that the study took place.
3 Phase One in Two States

The first phase of this study concerned the identification of effective teachers (ETs) and their characteristics and practices.

3.1 Methodology

The teams discussed the methodology for this between themselves and each other. A common framework was agreed that is summarised in the following diagram:

Led by the practitioners, the teams also brainstormed their own perspectives on the characteristics of an ET. This enabled them to identify the following key issues that served as the basis for their fieldwork:

- What problems ETs face
- What ETs do
- What ETs do differently from other teachers
- Enabling factors that help teachers to be effective
- Advice to other teachers

Working with the facilitators, the two teams designed the overall methodology outlined below. However, because of the research capacity strengthening strategy embedded in this study, they were encouraged to design their own focus group discussion (FGD) and interview questions.
SSOs and QAOs in each State were asked to identify a mix of 20 urban and rural schools that were representative of all public primary schools in the State. The head teachers in those schools were asked to identify two ETs. It was decided to let the head teachers use their own criteria (which are summarised below) in identifying ETs to avoid potentially biasing their choices. However, they were asked to ensure a gender balance.

FGDs were held with the SSOs and QAOs and with head teachers in both States to reflect on the characteristics of ETs. The FGDs focused on five issues:

- The characteristics of ETs
- Whether teachers’ areas of specialisation are consistent with the subject(s) they are assigned to teach
- Teachers use of instructional materials
- Whether teachers encourage participatory (pupil-centred) learning
- The problems affecting effective teaching in schools

Face-to-face interviews were conducted with the ETs and the researchers also observed their teaching when possible. When talking about their practice, and how it compares with other teachers, the ETs were asked about:

- Classroom management
- Pedagogy
- Resources
- Teacher-pupil relationships (in school and in the community)
- Professionalism

The ETs were invited to give personal experiences of these issues to ensure the interviews focused on their own practice. They were asked to compare their practice with that of other teachers (who, by implication, were less effective) to help them focus on their own practice and what made it effective. They were also invited to discuss other any issues they thought relevant to effective teaching.

Both teams agreed to conduct the fieldwork in pairs with one academic working with one practitioner. They also agreed to pair more experienced and less experienced team members to facilitate the capacity building within the teams.

The FGDs and interviews were transcribed and iteratively analysed on the basis of the key issues identified above and others emerging from the fieldwork. Responses were categorised and aggregated across the two State-based datasets. Responses were also aggregated by key variables (i.e. the urban-rural divide, gender, teacher qualification and length of service) but there were no significant differences between them except for the problem of travelling to work in rural schools.

3.2 Participating teachers

80 ETs took part in this phase of the study – 40 from Kaduna and 40 from Kano.
Most of the Kaduna group were female (which reflects the gender divide among teachers in primary schools in the State) but the Kano group were deliberately chosen to reflect a gender balance.

All the ETs identified in this study had professional qualifications. In the Kaduna group, 75% possessed an NCE (the minimum required qualification to teach) and most of the remaining 25% had a Bachelor Degree in Education (B.Ed) with only one possessing a Grade II Certificate and Higher National Diploma. In the Kano group, 85% had an NCE, 12.5% a B.Ed. and the remaining teacher a Post Graduate Certificate in Education.

Length of service generated an interesting State-based difference. Most of Kaduna ETs had spent 8-35 years teaching and some were about to retire. However, while nearly half the Kano teachers (18 of the 40) had more than ten years’ experience, nine of the 40 (22.5%) only had between one and five years’ experience.

### 3.3 The characteristics of effective teachers

SSOs, QAOs and head teachers were asked to identify the key characteristics of ETs. These are summarised in the list below. It should be noted that many of them are idealised and that there was a high degree of similarity in the responses from participants. This can be attributed to what one senior team member described as the ‘parroting’ of the characteristics of ETs identified by ESSPIN.

- Appropriately trained and possessing a suitable qualification (e.g. NCE, B.Ed.).
- Good knowledge of subject matter.
- Good classroom management skills, including knowledge of different teaching methodologies and the ability to use them appropriately.
- Able to deal with classroom problems.
- Able to use child-centred pedagogies that involve children in class activities.
- Possesses a clear understanding of the curriculum.
- Able to develop good lesson plans based on the curriculum.
- Able to use instructional materials that are appropriate to the subject and the level of understanding of the pupils.
- Always encourages pupils.
- Good time management skills.
- Good interpersonal skills with pupils and colleagues.
- Good understanding of professional ethics.

Such lists, however, cannot properly capture what ETs need in order to negotiate the problems of primary school classrooms in Kaduna and Kano. These characteristics were addressed through individual interviews with the selected ETs and are summarised here.

Appropriate qualifications are clearly seen as necessary to effective teaching. Length of service and experience are seen as important but not always necessary. Gendered issues are not considered here as the head teachers were asked to ensure a gender balance and so no conclusions can be drawn from their identification of female and male ETs.

The ETs in both States described themselves as having good subject knowledge. They also considered themselves to be punctual, conscious of the ethics of teaching, diligent and dedicated to their work. Most continue to be eager about professional development opportunities. However, overcrowded and under-resourced classrooms remain a significant problem. As one ET from a rural school noted: *The most pressing challenges I find daunting*
are the disproportionately large number of pupils per class which invariably makes it too unwieldy and the paucity of text books.\(^1\)

Facing such challenges, the ETs stressed the importance of effectively engaging their pupils throughout the school day. It requires particular skills to teach classes of up to 300 pupils. These ETs usually group their pupils into smaller groups to make classroom management easier and to encourage a more learner-centred approach to their teaching with stronger pupils supporting their weaker classmates. To save time and avoid constant disruption, most ETs introduce permanent grouping. The groups are assigned activities, with each member often being given a specific role, and pupils are encouraged to contribute in groups and as individuals.

Inadequate equipment is common and some ETs reported feeling helpless when their pupils are forced to sit on bare floors. ETs have to be resourceful when instructional materials are not readily available. Some Kaduna teachers reported being able to make use of local DFID-funded Learning Resource Centres and many described liaising with their PTAs and SBMCs to acquire resources. Others, in both States, are willing to purchase low-cost materials. All reported the need to improvise as illustrated by this typical comment from one of the teachers: *I use stones and bottle tops to teach counting.*

The teachers typically begin lessons by calming and focusing the students using a range of pedagogic methods (e.g. singing, storytelling) and many ETs make time to review previous lessons (e.g. by asking pupils questions). Different pedagogic methods are also used in the main lessons and ETs take care to ensure they are suitable for the subject being taught. A teacher from another rural school explained that: *If I realize that the pupils are not on the same page with me, I close the book and stop whatever I am doing and try another approach. Sometimes it pays in a situation like this if you introduce leisure. I narrate some anecdotal stories or even sing and at the end of the day, you will find them refreshed and eager to lend you their ears.*

Most ETs had good organisational skills. They use continuous assessment to record their pupils’ performance and progress. They usually make lesson plans in a timely manner and make use of relevant curricula and schemes of work. This typically enables them to cover the curricula. It also means they have good records, as noted by one teacher from an urban school who described how she: *regularly keeps records of work and prepares lesson plans and lesson notes in each of the subject.*

Effective communication requires ETs to use a combination of the local language and English. Praise and rewards are also used and some ETs noted that a firm voice helps. However, mild punishments (e.g. being kneel down or stand up in the class) are used for minor disciplinary problems such as lateness, noisiness and quarrelling.

These ETs typically highlighted the importance of pastoral care and the need to identify and discuss any problems their pupils have at school or home. They also emphasised the importance of being willing to give and take advice and guidance to improve their pupils’ learning opportunities.

Delayed payment of salaries and allowances and delayed promotions demotivate and distract ETs. Some reported a philosophical approach, explaining that such problems are temporary. Some receive support from their head teachers or spouses. Others turn to other means of earning money, such as farming or private teaching. Whatever solutions they find, it is generally recognised that delayed payments can undermine their effectiveness and even their willingness to teach. Nonetheless, some, like this teacher from a rural school in Kano, try to put on a brave face: *The biggest challenge for me so far is lack of promotion. I have not been promoted for the last 10 years now. However, much as that worries me, I do not allow it to becloud my thinking because the interest I have in the job overshadows all other considerations.*

---

\(^1\) Direct quotations from participating teachers and others are highlighted in italics throughout this report.
3.4 Comparisons with other teachers

The main purpose of seeking comparisons with other teachers was to help the ETs identify, discuss and reflect on their own effective teaching. However, their accounts of their less effective colleagues broadly correspond with issues identified in the wider literature. As the focus of this study is effective teachers, we do not dwell on ineffective teaching. However, by way of summarising that literature, less effective teachers do not possess some or all of the professional and personal characteristics of ETs noted above.

It is clear from these accounts that ETs are competent, focused and resourceful and that they recognise the needs of their pupils. Many of them described less effective colleagues failing to meet these descriptors of effective teaching.

Perhaps the most striking illustration of the difference between ETs and their less professional colleagues is this comment from a teacher in one of the rural schools involved in the study: *We are always prepared for our lessons, regularly keep records of work and prepare lesson plans and lesson notes unlike other teachers that we are working with. They only prepare a lesson plan when they know the supervisors are coming.*

3.5 Advice for other teachers

Based on their experience of the teaching in primary schools in Kaduna and Kano, these ETs offered words of advice for other teachers who aspire to be more effective. They need

- Patience, dedication and a willingness to work hard. Teachers must come to school early, stay through the day and engage the pupils in learning in spite of the daunting challenge of delays in payment of salaries and allowances.

- To be organized in their work as reflected in the planning of their lesson notes which should be based on the schemes of work and curricula. Lessons should use the most appropriate pedagogic methods for the pupils’ needs. Appropriate and suitable teaching materials and teaching aids should be sourced and used.

- To see themselves as role models in character, conduct and speech. They should develop a good rapport with the pupils but be firm when necessary.

- Above all, to take pride in their profession, giving it the required dignity so that outsiders can also dignify them.
4 Phase Two in Two States

For each of the four components of Phase 2 – the case studies, job descriptions, recruitment policy and deployment policy – a task list was generated to guide and structure the field research. This is presented at the beginning of each of the component discussions.

4.1 Case studies

Having generated clarity regarding the characteristics of ETs in Phase I, the research teams wondered whether there were ways in which this information could be used. Following discussions in and between the teams, it was agreed that the information could be presented in a series of case studies that could be used to highlight the day-to-day realities and commitment of ETs with a view to: (i) informing State-based policy decisions; (ii) improving the public perception of teaching (c.f. deployment policy, below); and (iii) encouraging secondary school and NCE students to consider a career in teaching.

The teams were advised of the purposes of the case studies and given a template. Each team was required to prepare 2-4 case studies that: (i) were broadly representative of the ETs they had been working with; and (ii) highlighted the key issues they had identified.

Case studies of ETs were then generated for each State, reviewed by the facilitators and then revised before being shared with stakeholders in the two States. As noted below, some policymakers saw little value in them and so they were not presented to the ESs at the stakeholder meetings in January. However, the final edited versions used in the earlier stages of the validation process are presented in Annexes A and B.

4.1.1 Task list: case studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essential</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Discuss with potential users (e.g. school-based guidance &amp; counselling services) and explore and document possible uses (e.g. publicity)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discuss with recruiters and explore and document possible use as guidance for recruitment processes, including interviews</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Desirable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Validate with ETs, HTs, QAs, SSOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discuss with senior high school students and explore and document possible uses</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

2 It is widely recognised that many NCE students enrol with no intention of pursuing a career in teaching.
4.1.2 Kaduna case studies

The two Kaduna case studies were shared with groups of students and lecturers from each of: College of Education Gidan Waya Kafanchan, College of Education Kaduna (10 students and ten lecturers); and Federal College of Education, Zaria (12 students and 11 lecturers).

The students welcomed the use of the case studies as pointing the way for them to become effective teachers. They suggested that other students could benefit from the case studies through:

- Students Union in the College
- Seminars and workshops
- Notice boards
- Departmental interaction
- Distribution to other students

They also suggested the most suitable times for sharing them as being:

- Beginning of the session
- Before going on teaching practice
- Before the examinations
- Towards graduation period

They explained that: *We have learned many things from these two case studies of Effective Teachers – Mrs Bawa and Madam Amina*. By the time we graduate from college we will go through the case studies again to ensure that we practice what they did in their schools, to enable us to become effective teachers, and also to produce effective school students who can become very effective (Focus group discussion with College of Education, Gidan Waya Kafanchan students).

It is important to note that participant lecturers from FCE, Zaria, were not comfortable with the case of Madam Amina (Annex A), who was identified as an ET with her lower primary Class Two. She had a B.Ed. degree in English Language and could profitably have been deployed to teach in Class Five or Class Six. Teachers for the lower grades should have a PES qualification.

In a second validation and out-reach process, the draft case studies were shared with ten Guidance & Counselling (G&C) Officers from Kaduna North and Kaduna South LGEAs, followed by their meeting as a group. Their responses to the case studies are given below:

- They commended EDOREN for identifying ETs and using them as case studies. They feel that such teachers should be motivated and used as role models to motivate other teachers to become more effective.
- The G & C officers agreed that the case studies should be used in schools for both serving teachers and the pupils; they can be used as role models that teachers should emulate: *because from the story of the identified effective teachers, even with all the numerous challenges they are faced with, they still do their...*
work effectively, deriving joy from it and improving teaching and learning, this is impressive (G&C Officer).

They suggested the following strategies for using the case studies:

- **The case study can be shared with other teachers to improve their teaching methodology.**

- **It can be shared in form of stories with the teachers, especially those that always complain of poor remuneration, inadequate instructional materials, late payment of salaries, over population and rowdiness of pupils.**

- **During assemblies, it can be shared with pupils in form of short stories to bring out the beauty of the teaching profession.**

- **During Guidance & Counselling periods, stories of prominent people from the society who are professional teachers can be narrated to the pupils.**

- **The pupils can be told the importance and benefits of being a teacher, that teachers are the back bone to every profession.**

- **Case studies of effective teachers can be used during the interview session to expose the prospective teacher on what to do to be an effective teacher, the challenges involved and how to overcome the challenges.**

### 4.1.3 Kano case studies

The case studies were shared with a range of educational stakeholders including the Permanent Secretary, the SUBEB Chairman and staff at the Federal Colleges of Education.

The CoE staff were divided on the potential benefits of the case studies with some suggesting that understanding the personal experiences of teachers might encourage students and others arguing that: *the case study will not serve as [a] motivating factor*. Both views appear to have been based on the authenticity of the cases. The latter argument raises concerns about what NCE students are told about the realities of teaching but that is beyond the scope of the current study.

Most of the stakeholders did not discuss the case studies but focused instead on the wider challenges framing them (e.g. the pay and conditions of teachers, the primary curriculum and the generally dilapidated state of primary schools in Kano State). There was limited discussion about the merits of the case studies. Most of the respondents were of the view that it is necessary to improve the conditions of service to improve the recruitment of effective teachers and that the case studies by themselves would not help this.

However, that the case studies generated discussions about the wider issues framing effective teaching – and that these discussions typically addressed the realities of teaching rather than idealised versions of it – highlights an important point: there is a place for evidence-based studies in the reform of primary education in Kano State.

### 4.1.4 Case descriptions: summary

The staff and students at the CoEs in both States saw the potential of the case studies for recruitment and training purposes.
However, the policymakers in Kano (they were not shared with policymakers in Kaduna) saw little value in them. The teams therefore agreed to prioritise the other protocols and the case studies were not shared with the LGEA ESs at the stakeholder meetings on 27 January 2017 (Kaduna ESs) and 30 January 2017 (Kano ESs).

4.2 Job descriptions

The teams were tasked with identifying ways in which the information about ETs could be used to inform State-based recruitment policies and practices. They readily acknowledged that appropriate job descriptions should be used to encourage applications from potential ETs and to deter applications from potentially ineffective teachers.

The teams were therefore asked to generate two job descriptions – one for lower primary and one for upper primary – and to discuss them with stakeholders. There was considerable similarity between the two sets of job descriptions and so the teams focused on those for lower primary during the second part of the validation process (i.e. the stakeholder meetings with ESs) to facilitate discussion of the broader principles rather than the specific details. These revised job descriptions for lower primary teaching positions are included as Annexes C and D.

4.2.1 Task list: job descriptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task list: Job descriptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Essential</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Identify any current job descriptions or advertisements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Identify other needs to be described</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Validate job descriptions with recruiters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Desirable</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Validate with other users (e.g. HTs, school-based guidance &amp; counselling services)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Validate with Colleges of Education (staff and/or students) and use to emphasise importance of PES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Explore potential links to job interviews (e.g. how teachers demonstrate characteristics of ETs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Optional</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Discuss advertising of job descriptions with recruiters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.2.2 Kaduna job descriptions

The population of students and lecturers was the same as that used for the case studies above.

A sample job description – for lower primary – is presented as Annex C.
The summarised responses of the stakeholders are presented below:

- The stakeholders commended this initiative and proposed that applicants should be exposed to the teaching job descriptions to prepare them for the task ahead of them.

- The job description should be clearly stated when candidates respond to an advertisement so that, before they apply, there are no illusions about what the job entails.

- All the requirements itemized in the two job descriptions clearly stated the qualities expected from an effective teacher. Any applicant who cannot demonstrate those qualities cannot be regarded as effective and should not be considered for employment as a teacher.

- The stakeholders concurred that the type of teachers required, their qualifications, area of specialization, teaching experience and other requirements including job description should be clearly specified in the advertisement.

- The job description should serve as a scheme of work for an aptitude test for the applicants.

- The evidence of registration with TRCN is also very important.

- The job descriptions should also include: (i) teachers are not allowed to use corporal punishment on pupils; and (ii) there will be incentives for teachers who accept postings to rural areas.

- In the job descriptions of Primary 1-3 teachers, ‘Core subjects’ should be replaced with PES subjects because PES subjects cover all the subjects taught in primary schools.

- Core subject areas are Mathematics, English, Basic Science, and Technology, Civic and Moral Education.

- Some of the reservations mentioned in relation to implementation of the job descriptions included lack of political will, political interference and poor finance.

Using this feedback, a lightly revised job description for the lower primary teacher (Years 1-3) was used as the basis for discussion in the LGEA ESs meeting of Friday, 27 January 2017.

Group discussion and plenary reporting resulted in small but significant suggestions for modifications and additions in future editions of the list, which were:

- As part of positive attitudes to work, the teacher should be appropriately dressed when in school.

- The teacher should have a good understanding of child psychology, specifically how children learn and the role of language (i.e. whether and when to use English and/or vernacular languages).

- The teacher should be computer literate.

4.2.3 Kano job descriptions

The exercise began with a review of the ways in which teaching posts are typically described in Kano State and of descriptions for other jobs advertised in local newspapers. It was agreed that the job descriptions should specifically address professional requirements (e.g. that applicants should already hold an NCE) and personal characteristics (e.g. that applicants should have an interest in working with children) as well as specifying the key demands of the job. The job descriptions made good use of the evidence from phase I of the study by highlighting issues raised by the effective teachers (e.g. ‘facilitate learning by establishing good relations with pupils, environment and resources’ and ‘Provide feedback to parents’).
A sample job description – for lower primary – is presented as Annex D.

The validation of the job descriptions involved working with:

- Representatives from SUBEB and the State Ministry of Education
- Lecturers of PES and core subjects in Colleges of Education
- Students of PES and core subjects
- Representatives from PTAs and SBMCs

The job descriptions were typically well-received and their purpose was understood but some modifications were suggested. Some of these were technical (e.g. suggesting that the minimum age requirement be lowered from 25 as some NCE graduates may be younger and should not be excluded). Others were advisory (e.g. it was suggested that applicants should dress decently as teachers act as role models for their pupils) and some recognised the difficulties faced by primary teachers (e.g. the lack of instructional materials meant that teachers should be able to improvise). These points were easily dealt with and were included in the revised job descriptions presented to the Kano Education Secretaries at the stakeholder meeting held on 30 January.

Other feedback – particularly those concerning class sizes – prompted debate. The original draft noted that applicants ‘must have the skill of managing large classes’ and it was suggested that the likely size of these classes be specified. However, the team rejected this suggestion on the grounds that: (i) class sizes vary from school to school; and (ii) highlighting maximum class sizes (currently c. 300 pupils in some schools) would deter potential applicants. It was also suggested that it would be difficult to provide effective evaluation of pupils in such large classes. However, the team concluded that individual evaluation was an important aspect of effective teaching and that it should therefore be retained.

The validation process highlighted the political economy of Kano State as some respondents argued that only indigenes should be considered for teaching positions in the state. This suggestion was rejected because it was felt more important to employ effective teachers than to provide State-born teachers with jobs irrespective of their ability to teach.

Following the validation process, some minor modifications were made to the job descriptions before they were presented to the Education Secretaries at the stakeholder meeting held on 30 January 2017.

4.3 Recruitment policy: needs assessment, advertising and recruitment

It was agreed that this section should be considered under three headings: (i) Needs Assessment; (ii) Advertising and Application Processes; (iii) Selection and Interview Processes. The concern with the Advertising and Application Process was highlighted during the validation of the overall recruitment policy instrument and was refined during the January meetings before being presented at the first stakeholders’ meetings on 27 January in Kaduna and 30 January in Kano.
4.3.1 Task list: recruitment policy

**Recruitment Policy**

**Essential**

- Identify range of stakeholders
- Discuss and validate suggested policy with range of stakeholders (note: must ensure adequate time for detailed discussion)
- Revise documents

**Desirable**

- Ensure policy suggestions include transparency of recruitment policies and practices
- Draft recruitment interview framework
- Explore potential links to job descriptions and case studies

**Optional**

- Test interview panel
- Draft longitudinal study of recruitment practices

4.3.2 Needs assessment

At present there is no systematic collection of data from primary schools in relation to their staffing needs. This is recognised as a serious deficit, which frequently results in poor matches between school staffing needs and placements made from the centre.

**Kaduna needs assessment**

Stakeholders agreed that the following should be the components of a structured process:

- Needs assessment should be a regular, annual calendared process which should be done by head teachers, ES, SSOs and SUBEB officials. Submission should be to the LGA and SUBEB.
- Head teachers must play a central role as they are the ones who can see vacancies coming up.
- A Teachers Management Information System (TMIS) is needed to collate, store and share data on needs for teachers across the state. The Director of Administration & Supply (DAS) expressed reservations regarding TMIS, due to lack of finances and inadequate knowledge of computer systems.
Kano needs assessment

It had been suggested that Head Teachers should provide lists of forthcoming vacancies and submit details of voluntary teachers working in their schools to ensure their practical experience was taken into account. It had also been suggested that SUBEB and the LGEAs should liaise with the State’s CoEs to encourage students to take the practicum.

The draft was discussed with the Permanent Secretary, the SUBEB Chairman and Directors and Deputy Directors from SUBEB. They agreed that Head Teachers should submit lists of vacancies annually. However, the SUBEB officers were unanimous in rejecting the suggestions that lists of voluntary teachers should be provided and that the practicum should be encouraged. No obvious reason was given for these disagreements but it can be inferred they were at least in part related to the State’s political economy (below). However, the team decided that the concern with voluntary teachers’ experience was sufficiently important to be retained.

4.3.3 Advertising and application processes

Both teams had initially proposed that vacancies would be advertised via electronic and print media and this is what had been presented to selected stakeholders during the validation process for suggested changes to the States’ recruitment policies. However, a very interesting development subsequently emerged – that the prime mechanism for advertising vacancies should be online. In part, this was based on the very positive experience of Kano State in using online advertising only for the recruitment of JSS teachers over the last three years and on the intention of Kaduna State to take the same route.

Two important related points were raised: (i) that relevant stakeholders (the CoEs, SUBEB, etc.) should liaise to create a database of NCE graduates and their contact details; and (ii) that more traditional recruitment methods should also be used – at least during an interim period – to ensure potentially effective teachers living in remote areas would not be disadvantaged by the use of online mechanisms to advertise vacancies (it was agreed that, having been alerted to any vacancies, such candidates would need to submit online applications).

It is also worth emphasising that there is a constant concern by all stakeholders regarding political interference in these processes. It was therefore made clear that there should be strict adherence to these new protocols which will be amenable to regular monitoring.

Kaduna advertising and application processes

The response to the suggestion of online advertising and recruitment was best summed up by one LGEA ES who said *Initial effort for online high, but impact high*. The feedback from the initial validation process and the ES meeting was that:

- All advertisements of vacancies to be done by the LGA/LGEA in conjunction with SUBEB.
- SUBEB to retain oversight recruitment process of teachers on grade level 7 and above while the LGA/LGEA will be responsible for the advertisements but subject to SUBEB’s vetting and approval.
- Both print and electronic media to be used, at least until there was confidence that no potential applicant is being excluded by dependency on on-line approaches.
- Job descriptions to be included in the advertisements.
• Given that each LGEA/LGA will know, in due course from the TMIS, its staffing needs for its primary schools, applicants will apply to a single LGEA/LGA.

If on-line advertising goes forward, it should be a small step to moving the application process on-line.

Kano advertising and application processes

The initial validation process, based on the draft recruitment policy document shared with selected stakeholders, highlighted several issues linked to the political economy of Kano State.

It was suggested that independent consultants should be involved in the recruitment processes but this was rejected. It was explained that vacancies are shared out to State politicians and councillors and others holding positions of authority and power. This was then justified on the grounds that selection and interview processes are strictly adhered to no matter who effectively nominates the applicants. The suggestion was subsequently dropped.

The stakeholders raised concerns that the suggested policy did not exclude out-of-State applicants (it was argued that there currently enough indigenes to fill the vacancies). The team rejected this suggested change but indicated that it could be addressed through the online advertising and recruitment process.

Although there was broad agreement for policies that would make it easier to recruit effective teachers, this was limited by the pool of applicants from which they could be drawn, i.e. they should be indigenes with the right connections. That there might be effective teachers who do not meet these requirements does not seem to have been considered.

The suggestion of online advertising and application processes was put to the ESs and was met with broad approval, particularly when it was explained that filters could be added to address concerns about applicants having appropriate qualifications and being indigenous to the State.

4.3.4 Selection and interview processes

Interviews are an important part of recruitment processes as they offer applicants the opportunity to demonstrate their suitability and offer the interview panel the opportunity to assess the suitability of those applicants. The significance of the interview was highlighted by the key stakeholders in Kano State who explained that they could be used to filter out unsuitable candidates put forward by the patronage of ‘godfathers.’

Kaduna selection and interview processes

In response to the suggestions proposed by the State team, the stakeholders consulted offered the following proposals:

• In order to assess the performance and skills of candidates in written and spoken English, a case study should be given to the candidate to study and answer questions on the passage.

• The candidates should be given the opportunity to respond to the job description, possibly with a structured teaching test (recognising that organising that may be too challenging). Candidates should
know the school(s) and post(s) for which they are being interviewed. They should be able to show a clear understanding of what will be required of them.

- The interview venues will be situated in the relevant LGA. The panel composition should include representatives of NUT, SUBEB as well as head teachers.

- The case has been put for an SBMC representation on interview panels, but there are contrasting opinions about this. It could be trialled.

- Both head teachers and SSOs advised that some experienced head teachers should be engaged in the interview process.

- There is a strong view that there must be a female representative on the interview panel (this has not normally been the case). There are many female head teachers in the State. Alternatively, the NUT representative could always be nominated as female.

- An interesting option would be to introduce a group interview, in the form of a discussion, chaired by one of the interview panel members.

- Successful candidates will be recommended for appointment by the panel and their names forwarded to LGA/SUBEB for approval.

- They will be contacted regarding their employment status via their phone numbers and/or by pasting their names on the notice board at the LGA.

- The names of successful candidates should be placed at strategic places for adequate publicity.

As soon as possible after the decision has been made to make an appointment, the successful candidate must be given a contract showing her/his entitlements, alongside the commitments made by the State in respect of her/his employment.

**Kano selection and interview processes**

Proposed selection criteria included a focus on suitably qualified applicants and the importance of qualification in relevant subjects, particularly PES, as well as previous experience of teaching (e.g. the NCE practicum). The stakeholders had already rejected these suggestions (above) but the team decided they should be pursued.

The stakeholders agreed with the development of core interview questions to be asked of all candidates to ensure fairness and emphasised the need to target subject knowledge and pedagogic practices.

They also acknowledged that the interview panels should demonstrate gender balance. However, there was some disagreement over the number of panellists and the institutions to be represented. The team had suggested up to five panellists, including a Head Teacher who could ask about the practical use of pedagogic theory. The PS recommended limiting the number of panellists to three and excluding the Head Teacher (although there would be some school representation through the inclusion of a member of the SBMCs). On reflection, the team concluded that there should be a Head Teacher on the panel.

There was agreement on the need to assess candidates through the use of written tests and oral interviews. There was also agreement that successful candidates should be willing to serve anywhere in the State.
4.4 Deployment policy

One of the main concerns with deployment is that of posting teachers to rural schools. A further complication is the definition of ‘rural schools’ and it was agreed that this should be a given distance from centres providing local government services, medical facilities and transport links.

Beyond that, if the new approach to selection is taken forward, then elements of deployment fall into place. The successfully recruited teacher will know within which LGA/LGEA she/he will be posted. Hopefully, they will already be assigned to a named school. They will sign a contract which names their school of assignment, indicating whether they will be teaching in the lower primary school (those with PES qualifications) or the upper primary if they have subject specialisms relevant to the available posting.

4.4.1 Task list: deployment policy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key tasks: Deployment policy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Essential</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Finalise documents, submit for review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Identify range of stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Discuss and validate suggested policy with range of stakeholders (note: must ensure adequate time for detailed discussion)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Revise documents, submit for review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Desirable</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ensure policy suggestions include transparency of recruitment policies and practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Explore potential links to case studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Optional</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Draft longitudinal study of deployment practices</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.4.2 Kaduna deployment policy

It was acknowledged that:

- The contract for all primary teachers should state a minimum period of deployment to their contract school – possibly 2 or 3 years. The teacher would not be eligible for re-location before the end of that period.

- Upon employment, the human resource personnel department should place the teacher at the correct point of the salary scale, consistent with their qualifications and relevant experience.
• It is clear that some form of incentive payment will be appropriate for those teachers posted to the most remote, rural schools. Stakeholders identify a number of possible incentives, which are, in no particular order:
  
  o An extra allowance of a percentage of their basic salary (25% has been mentioned).
  
  o Loans, subsidised housing, prioritised access to continuing professional development (CPD) programmes, accelerated promotion (only if consistent with their performance).
  
  o Farm land subsidy made available by the SBMC of their school.

4.4.3 Kano deployment policy

The main concern in Kano State is the deployment of teachers to rural schools and this was the major focus of the team’s work. The validation process involved suggestions to the Permanent Secretary and SUBEB Directors and Deputy Directors.

Current practice encourages deployment to the teacher’s home LGEA or neighbouring LGEAs. However, feedback from the stakeholders indicated a reversal of this as they insisted that teachers should be willing to be deployed anywhere in the State without the opportunity to present preferences.

There was general agreement on the need to make rural postings more attractive, including liaison with SBMCs to engage local communities in making this happen and the proper payment of rural allowances. However, the team’s suggestion that rural postings could be enhanced through prioritised promotion was rejected by the stakeholders who argued that promotion should be equally available to all. The team accepted this.

It was suggested that teachers posted to rural schools should have the opportunity for preferential relocation after three years. The PS suggested this be raised to five years and this was accepted by the team. Concerns raised by other stakeholders indicated the mistaken belief that the suggested relocations would be mandatory. As this was a misunderstanding, those concerns were ignored.

There was unanimous support for the suggestion that there should be specific CPD programmes for rural teachers. However, the content and funding of these programmes was not discussed.

Some stakeholders suggested that there should be more support from other funders (e.g. International NGOs) but this was rejected by the team as the State would have no control over it.
5 Stakeholder Dialogues: LGEA Education Secretaries

5.1 Validation processes

In order to take the validation processes, including discussions of key issues, to a higher level, two half-day meetings of LGEA Education Secretaries (ESs) were convened. 23 ESs from Kaduna (or their representatives) met on 26 January and 44 from Kano on 30 January.

From both groups, there was a high level of appreciation of the priorities of this research, as both States struggle, in often challenging environments, to strengthen their primary teaching cadre. There is recognition at the level of the LGEA that much needs to be done to achieve: (i) the purpose of locating committed teachers with appropriate skill-sets; and (ii) getting them settled into schools with sensible levels of resources for teaching and learning. Suggestions were made as outcomes from group work, in the following areas: job descriptions; needs analysis; advertising; interview process; deployment. These are documented in turn in the following sections.

5.2 Job descriptions

The following suggestions were made for additions to the listed job descriptions:

- Computer literacy
- Dress code
- Understanding of how children learn / child psychology
- Curriculum planning skills

5.3 Needs analysis

It was recognised that for there to be a sensible approach to recruitment, there should be an annual census of staffing needs for each school in the LGEA, updated as appropriate. This should be held electronically as a Teacher Management Information System (TMIS), which need not be complex.

5.4 Advertising of posts

There was a very high level of agreement and support for the process to move to on-line advertising and application. Recognition that this may require high level of early investment of effort, but anticipated high impact.
5.5 Interview process

There shall be high levels of adherence to the validated protocols in order to minimise patronage (in the group there is a strong anxiety about the likelihood of interference). The interviewing committees should include head teachers (of whom 50% in Kaduna are women), NUT representatives and members of women’s’ groups.

5.6 Deployment

On acceptance of a job offer, tied to a particular school, a contract should be issued documenting the responsibilities of the employer and the employee. This will include any allowances, in cash or kind, for those teaching in challenging rural schools.

5.7 Final validation meeting

Senior officials from the two States – and observers from Jigawa, Yobe and Zamfara States – met with the research teams on 5 April 2017. The protocols (some slightly amended from earlier the earlier validation process) were presented to them and were met with considerable approval. The presence of these observers from the other three States is particularly encouraging because it indicates the appetite for evidence-based policy change in Northern Nigeria.
6 Conclusions

Working in two States of Northern Nigeria, it has proved possible and constructive to create research teams which unusually brought together those who are charged with carrying out research (four academics) and those who are charged with managing a primary education system (four MoE and SUBEB staff). Each team had a balance of genders. Careful preparation of the teams gave them confidence to carry out fieldwork at a variety of levels – school, LGEA, SUBEB and MoE. A separate report (Watts & Akogun, 2017) addresses this in greater detail.

Phase One of the research allowed the identification in each State of a group of between 40 and 50 effective primary teachers, through a process of nomination (to identify a population for study), interview and classroom observation. The data generated was used to develop: (i) a series of case studies; and (ii) clearly defined job descriptions for both P1-P3 and P4-P6 teachers. Additionally, there was important learning about how these teachers operated successfully – where success was measured by their recognition as ETs – in frequently less than conducive working environments.

Phase Two of the research depended on the development of strong draft protocols for each part of the recruitment and deployment processes for primary teachers. So that, for recruitment, descriptions were generated covering the following areas: needs analysis; advertising and applying; testing and interviewing; appointing. At least in part as a result of the team composition, it proved possible to undertake a validation process with the drafts, through interactions with different groups of stakeholders, chiefly those with direct responsibility for teacher recruitment, thus: MoE and SUBEB Directors; LGEA Education Secretaries; Head teachers. We conclude that, for each State, a robust set of instruments is now ready for wider field testing, in pilot/trial settings.

We note and acknowledge the continuing undercurrent of scepticism regarding the ways in which these instruments may be undermined by political decisions (often legitimate) and patronage (never legitimate). Our response is simply that policy-related research of this kind can only provide the tools by which transparent processes can occur if there is a supportive political will. We have to presume that the development of quality primary schooling for all children is a high order political priority in both States.

We take this opportunity to report early successes relating to the use of the findings of this research in Kaduna State. It is not an accident that a member of the Kaduna research team is the Director of Recruitment. For the next recruitment cycle, commencing in May 2017, she has already been able to put in place new approaches to: school staffing needs analysis; on-line job advertising; use of job descriptions in the recruitment process; and, overhaul of interview procedures. Work in progress is consideration of significant allowances for rural postings.

Over the next year, there are two priorities:

- In Kaduna and Kano States, initiating well-structured pilots and trials of the various approaches in carefully managed and observed settings. This will strengthen the relationships between the research teams and the management cadre.

- Taking the approach to different States, with different levels of EDOREN-related inputs.
References


Annex A  Case Studies of Effective Teachers in Kaduna State

A.1  Case study one

Amina was identified as an effective teacher in a public Primary School in Kaduna Metropolis. She has a B.Ed in English Language and has been teaching for the past 16 years. She teaches primary 2. Surprisingly she teaches the entire range of subjects. She has received trainings on ESSPIN (Numeracy and Literacy) as well as the SMASE teacher professional development.

Some of the challenges she faces include the distance to school, overpopulation with a class of 118 pupils, dilapidated facilities, broken chairs and desks, inadequate textbooks, writing materials, teaching aids, inadequate toilet facility and water supply, delays in promotion and payment of salary, lack of proper support and recognition in the society.

Despite these challenges Amina is committed to making a difference. She devised ways of handling the challenges to achieve good results. She leaves her house at 5:30am daily when it is still dark in order to be in school before 7:00am to organize her class before the pupils’ arrival. Getting all her instructional materials ready ahead of time, during break or at home, allows her to manage her lesson time effectively. She employs teaching techniques like singing and dancing, drama, story-telling, simulation games etc. to involve all the children in class activities, irrespective of their needs, using child-centred approach. The pupils are mostly grouped (both slow and fast learners) for easier management and so that the fast learners will assist the slow learners to catch up. She goes round to supervise and gives extra attention to the weak ones so that they are carried along. She solicits the support of the head teacher and sometimes uses her resources to provide writing materials to pupils. To address pupils’ indiscipline, she draws the pupils close to her for guidance and counselling, and discusses her concerns with the head teacher and parents.

She speaks the language of the immediate environment even though she is not from that community. Watching her teach you could actually see the passion, the determination to make learning take place at all cost. The pupils’ excitement and delight in the process is clearly seen as they engage in one activity or the other individually or as a team from the beginning to the end of a lesson.

Her motivation comes from the will to produce the best pupils academically and morally to build a better society.

A.2  Case study two

This Effective Teacher (ET) teaches in LGEA primary school, Kigo Road, Kaduna and has been teaching for the past 10 years. She holds a Grade II Certificate and NCE in English and Social Studies but teaches integrated Science and Mathematics in P3.

Mrs. Bawa always prepares and plans her lessons based on the scheme of work. She uses break time to prepare her lessons and mark pupils’ exercises. This is corroborated by the account of her head teacher. She usually designs, produces and utilises the most suitable instructional materials for every lesson to suit the needs of the pupils and this makes her lesson interesting and lively.

On entering the class she takes time to calm her pupils down, get their full attention before embarking on the lesson of the day. For example, she revises the previous lesson by asking the pupils about it. If they are able to remember, she continues. Otherwise she reminds them before proceeding to the day’s lesson. She groups the pupils into smaller units mainly because of the large population of the class and to encourage team work.
In delivering her lesson, when she tries the play-way method and the pupils are not following or are uninterested, she switches to story-telling, demonstration or question and answer method just to make sure they understand the concept. She encourages the pupils’ participation through class activity; she uses praises, prizes, gifts and claps to motivate her pupils.

Mrs Bawa is however, confronted with a number of challenges like irregular payment of salaries and allowances, inadequate teaching materials, truancy and late coming on the part of the pupils, inadequate infrastructure and furniture, overpopulation and no opportunities for further education and regular re-training.

She makes efforts to overcome the challenges that are within her control. In the case of overpopulation, she groups the pupils into smaller groups with group leaders. Where text books are not enough she encourages sharing. She improvises instructional materials locally sourced, to the extent of using her money to buy materials herself despite the irregular pay. She also buys writing materials for the pupils that do not have any. On the challenges of truancy and late coming, she counsels the pupils and, in exceptional cases, she visits their homes.

For her some of the motivating factors are the support and encouragement from the Head Teacher, School Support Officers; and the enthusiasm of pupils. She commands respect from parents and other community members even though she is not wealthy. It gives her joy to look back and see the number of pupils she has taught who become successful in life.
Annex B  Case Studies of Effective Teachers in Kano State

B.1  Case study one

One of the effective teachers in Kano State had 15 years of experience as a teacher and had taught in three different schools. His current posting is in a rural primary school. He has to deal with many problems but he is proud to work there.

The rural location means he finds it difficult to arrive at the school on time yet he insists on taking morning lessons. He is punctual but other teachers are not always on time. The classes are always congested with over 150 pupils and more and there are never enough instructional materials or resources for all the pupils. He is worried about the lack of textbooks because there are not enough for all the pupils. The children do not always want to listen and some of them are noisy. This makes teaching very difficult and he said that he sometimes thinks of changing his job. However, he took a long time nurturing his teaching career and convinced himself to stay even though he is worried when he is not paid on time.

He has good classroom management skills. He identifies the pupils who make the most noise and assigns them as group leaders so that he has the attention of the class. This makes it more easy to teach the pupils and he uses different methods in the classrooms depending on the lesson and the situation. Using different teaching methods engages the pupils more.

He feels proud to be a teacher and his effectiveness has been recognised. His Head Teacher has commended his efforts and recommended him for Best Teacher of the Year to the LGEA. The Head Teacher said ‘He handles the morning session of the school very well, he is prompt and punctual always, diligent in teaching, he goes to class for lessons before other teachers, and enters classes whose teachers are not present.’ Similarly, the School Support Officer (SSO) responsible for that school recommended him ‘in recognition of his keeping pupils busy during the last week of the term after examinations.’

This effective teacher says he enjoys teaching even though he faces many challenges being a good teacher. When he struggles he reminds himself that he finds the job interesting and thinks it is something that is worth doing. He is pleased that his hard work is recognised by the Head Teacher and the SSO. He is also pleased that his pupils like being taught by him.

B.2  Case study two

Another effective teacher in Kano State has been teaching for six years. She works in an urban school and has been at the same school since she got her NCE.

She loves her job but sometimes finds it very difficult. She has to deal with large class sizes and the lack of textbooks for her pupils. She thinks the conditions of service are poor and she gets upset and worried about the poor public recognition of teachers. This is the biggest problem and she thinks it would be easier to be a teacher if the community understood the difficulties she deals with every day. Like she said, it is difficult to teach children if you do not have the proper materials.

She loves being a teacher. She deals with the problems of large classes and not enough materials by improvising. Like a lot of other teachers she gets the children to help and so for example she encourages them to bring bottle tops and stones into the class to help them learn to count. She thinks this involves the children in their own learning and this helps them to understand her lessons very well. She knows that many teachers do things like this because there are not enough materials. But she knows that her pupils really enjoy her teaching. She thinks this is because she likes to bring the pupils closer to her and to let them be free with her when they need
somebody to talk to. She is always willing to listen to the concerns of the children and she thinks that this is why they like her teaching so much.

She has good relations with her pupils to the extent of serving as custodian of valuables from the children. She knows this good relationship with the children is important and so she makes sure she asks their parents why they are not in school. The parents know she is interested in their children and wants them to learn. With some parents this helps them to understand the importance of education for their children.

She thinks her work improves relationships between the school and the community because some parents tell her this. But she knows that not all teachers are the same. She gets frustrated with some of the other because they do not care about the children. This does not help people in the community understand that being a good teacher is difficult. She will continue being a teacher though because she loves her job and she knows that her pupils and their parents recognise the hard work she does.
Annex C   Proposed Job Description for Kaduna State

Job description for lower primary school teachers (1-3)

The candidates should have:

- Good knowledge of content in the PES subjects
- Excellent skills in the teaching of literacy (reading/writing) and numeracy
- Good communication skills in both English and the language of the immediate environment
- Good practical knowledge of the curriculum
- Effective skills in lesson delivery using relevant instructional materials
- Effective skills in classroom management (discipline, control, organisation of pupils into groups)
- Good record keeping ability

In addition, the candidates should be able to:

- Plan lessons effectively
- Use a variety of methods or approaches in teaching
- Demonstrate the ability to motivate their pupils using rewards, incentives, praise etc.
- Use effective assessment techniques e.g. class exercises, assignments, continuous assessment, tests, group work and examinations
- Establish and maintain good rapport with pupils, colleagues and members of the community
- Show concern for the holistic development of their pupils
- Demonstrate positive attitudes to work, e.g. dedication to work, passion, hard work, resourceful, initiative, balanced temperament and being a role model to pupils
- Overcome challenges – over-large classes, inadequate instructional materials, etc.
Annex D  
**Proposed Job Description for Kano State**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job description for lower primary school teachers (1-3)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professional and Personal Characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The candidate should:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• possess NCE qualifications as a minimum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• be competent in both English and vernacular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• have good communication skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• have an interest in interacting with children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• be able to adapt to challenging situations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• have good character</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• be punctual and dress decently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successful candidates will be expected to:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• develop schemes of work in line with curriculum objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• teach all areas of the primary curriculum, including reading and writing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• demonstrate good lesson delivery and classroom management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• engage pupils in learning and motivate them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• facilitate learning by establishing good relations with pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• evaluate the pupils effectively</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• be able to manage large classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• use various methods in teaching and a variety of instructional materials and to be able to improvise where necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• develop instructional materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• engage pupils in extracurricular activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• organise and take part in school events, working with parents and school management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• provide feedback to parents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• keep proper records, including lesson plans and lesson notes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>